

Title of paper: _____

Author(s) of paper: _____

Referee number: _____

My favorite thing in the paper

In **complete sentences**, identify the thing you liked best: a nice theorem or proof, a helpful explanation, etc.

Numerical ratings

Rate each of the following aspects of the paper on a scale of 1 to 5, where

- 1 = "strongly disagree"
- 2 = "disagree"
- 3 = "neutral"
- 4 = "agree"
- 5 = "strongly agree"

	1	2	3	4	5
I understood the main topic of the paper					
The paper is directed to the correct audience (Math 4441 students)					
The abstract gives a good summary of the paper					
The paper presents at least one substantial proof or computation					
The mathematical notation is consistent					
The paper is free of serious mathematical errors					
New ideas are well-motivated					
The presentation is in a logical order					
The paper was carefully proofread					
Adequate references are provided					

Explanation of ratings

For the three lowest-rated items above, explain your numerical rating. This explanation should be **helpful** and **constructive**, and not mean-spirited.

Suggested improvements

Give three concrete suggestions for improvement. For instance, these could be ways of improving any low ratings you gave above.

Questions

What questions do you have about the paper? For instance, "where did these ideas come from?" or "can you give an example of..." are good questions.